

## **20 STUDY AREA 20: HIGHWAY 191 (CLARK ROAD)/ DURHAM PENTZ**

Study Area 20, Highway 191 (Clark Road)/Durham Pentz, consists of 640 acres located at the intersection of Highway 191 and Durham-Pentz Road in central Butte County, near the Butte College campus. The majority of the study area is currently undeveloped and used for agricultural purposes, although there is gas station and convenience store located at the intersection of Highway 191 and Durham-Pentz Road.

- ◆ Alternative 1 follows the existing General Plan, designating the majority of the study area for agricultural purposes, as well as about 20 acres of Retail near the intersection of Highway 191 and Durham-Pentz Road.
- ◆ Alternative 2 designates the majority of the study area for Agriculture, as well as about 60 acres of Very Low Density Residential, allowing about 60 homes. In addition, the retail uses would increase to about 30 acres under this alternative.
- ◆ Under Alternative 3, a larger area would be designated for residential purposes, including about 150 acres of Rural Residential and 150 acres of a mix of residential densities, allowing about 430 new homes. The retail designation from Alternative 2 would remain, and the remainder would be designated for Agriculture.

### *A. Economics*

#### **1. Market Viability**

##### **a. Alternative 1**

With 261,000 square feet of planned new retail development, Alternative 1 calls for the equivalent of a modest-sized community retail center, which might normally require a population of about 20,000+ people within a 5-mile radius. Due to its location on a secondary highway, isolated from any significant concentrations of population, the likelihood of supporting a substantial portion of the planned new retail development is low. Since feasibility of the only new development under Alternative 1 is questionable, it receives a D.

b. Alternative 2

Market viability for the retail component of Alternative 2 is probably low, particularly as this alternative allows substantially more retail space than Alternative 1, but allows only 60 new homes. Market viability for the 60 homes may be adequate over the General Plan planning horizon, due to the potential to attract some housing demand for people employed nearby at Butte College. Since the absorption potential of the retail component is low, but absorption potential of the residential component is reasonable, Alternative 2 receives a C.

c. Alternative 3

Market viability for the retail component of Alternative 3 is probably low. While Alternative 3 would allow an additional 430 homes at buildout, this, combined with other existing that may be scattered in the surrounding areas, is nowhere near what would be necessary to support the planned amount of new retail development. In regard to market support for the planned residential component, the large existing job base in the study area, combined with the increased job capacity that is considered under some alternatives, would help to create demand for the residential unit; however, this study area is an untested market for large-scale residential development. Since both the retail and the residential components of Alternative 3 have questionable absorption potential, Alternative 3 receives a D.

## 2. Fiscal Impacts

a. Alternative 1

This study area is located in a TRA in which Butte County receives an above-average 20.5 percent of the property taxes. In addition, for new development, Alternative 1 proposes only retail development, which equates to strong revenue potential. Study Area 20 is located in an area that is far removed from the eight-minute travel time ranges of any of the County's existing full-time staffed fire stations, but the amount of new retail development in Alternative

1 would not be expected to trigger the need for increased levels of fire protection service. Therefore, Alternative 1 receives an A.

b. Alternative 2

Alternative 2 is similar to Alternative 1, but it allows additional new retail development potential as well as 60 new single-family residential units. Alternative 2 also receives an A.

c. Alternative 3

As discussed above under Alternatives 1 and 2, this alternative would bring some potential for fiscal benefits due to the strong revenue potential from retail uses. Alternative 3 also includes a larger number of residential units. However, the amount of development in Alternative 3 would not be expected to trigger the need for a new fire station. Therefore, Alternative 3 also receives an A.

### 3. Jobs/Housing Balance

a. Alternative 1

There are currently more jobs than housing in the study area around Study Area 20 due to the presence of the Butte College campus and the lack of significant housing supply. With a focus on only new retail development, and no new housing, Alternative 1 would tend to exacerbate this existing jobs/housing imbalance, and receives a D.

b. Alternative 2

Alternative 2 would also tend to exacerbate an excess of jobs in the immediate area relative to housing, but does include 60 new housing units, and therefore receives a C.

c. Alternative 3

Alternative 3 includes a significant amount of job-generating retail uses, which would tend to exacerbate an existing surplus of jobs relative to housing in the immediate area. However, this retail is unlikely to fully build out,

while the 430 new homes allowed under this alternative would help to balancing jobs/housing ratio in the local area. Therefore, Alternative 3 receives a B.

*B. Public Services*

**1. Fire and Emergency Service**

The Butte County Fire Department and CAL FIRE provide fire protection and emergency services to Study Area 20. In general, there is not adequate staffing to handle more than two serious fire events or several less-serious emergencies at once in Butte County. Any new development in the county will impact the level of fire protection and emergency services.

There are no fire stations within the boundaries of Study Area 20. Currently, the closest fire station is the Butte County/CAL FIRE Fire Station 45, a career- and volunteer-staffed station located more than 3 miles away. However, Butte County and CAL FIRE have plans to construct a new fire station at Butte College, which is expected to be complete by 2010. This station will be located less than 1 mile from Study Area 20.

The majority of Study Area 20 is located within the eight-minute travel area for the future fire station at Butte College. When this station is operational, the majority of Study Area 20 will have very low density residential service levels. None of the study area has adequate service levels for suburban residential, retail or industrial development.

a. Alternative 1

Alternative 1 calls for retail development, which typically requires high fire and emergency service levels because it includes assets of high economic value and generates customers that depend on those services. This minimal development would not have adequate levels of fire and emergency services

due to high travel times and a low concentration of fire stations in the immediate area. Therefore, this alternative receives a C.

b. Alternative 2

Alternative 2 calls for approximately 60 new homes at a very low density, as well as retail uses. Although the majority of the residential development would have adequate fire and emergency service levels, the retail development would not due to high travel times and a low concentration of fire stations in the immediate area. Therefore, this alternative receives a C.

c. Alternative 3

Alternative 3 calls for approximately 430 new homes at rural and suburban densities, as well as retail uses. Although the majority of the rural residential development would have adequate fire and emergency service levels, the suburban residential and retail development would not due to high travel times and a low concentration of fire stations in the immediate area. Therefore, this alternative receives a C.

## 2. Sheriff Services

Study Area 20 is served by the Southern Division of the Butte County Sheriff's Office (BCSO). The BCSO is currently understaffed and has limited capacity for expansion of its services. The Southern Division typically has about three to four deputies on duty in the Oroville area. Although Study Area 20 is located along Highway 191, its distance from the Oroville area can lead to increased response times.

There is no police station located within the boundaries of Study Area 20; however, the Butte County Sherriff station in the City of Chico is located less than 10 miles away from the study area.

a. Alternatives 1 and 2

Alternatives 1 and 2 call for some retail development, and Alternative 2 calls for approximately 60 new homes, which would not likely generate the need

for new officers. Because Alternatives 1 and 3 allow development that would not likely generate the need for new officers in an area with slow response times, they receive a C.

b. Alternative 3

Alternative 3 would allow approximately 430 new homes and some retail development, generating the need for about two new officers in an area with slow response times. Therefore, this alternative receives a C.

**3. Capacity of School Districts**

Study Area 20 is served by the Durham Unified School District (DUSD). This District has been experiencing declining enrollment, but is operating near capacity. As described in more detail under the Paradise Urban Reserve study area and Study Area 15, DUSD currently has capacity for approximately 30 additional students and does not have any specific expansion plans.

a. Alternative 1

Under Alternative 1, Study Area 20 would not generate any new students, so schools are not an issue.

b. Alternative 2

Under Alternative 2, the Durham study area could generate approximately 30 new students, which could be accommodated by the existing capacity. The total amount of development foreseen under Alternative 2 in all of the study areas within the DUSD could generate approximately 4,690 new students, four times the current enrollment in the District and about 4,660 students beyond current capacity.

Because the number of new students generated by this study area could be accommodated by the existing capacity, this alternative receives an A.

c. Alternative 3

Under Alternative 3, the Durham study area could generate approximately 210 new students, which would exceed the current capacity by about 180 students. The total amount of development foreseen under Alternative 3 in all of the study areas within the DUSD could generate approximately 1,690 new students, about 1,660 students beyond current capacity.

Because this study area could generate more students than could be accommodated by the existing capacity, but would not generate enough students to support the construction of new schools, this alternative receives a D.

*C. Water*

**1. Water Supply**

Study Area 20 is located within the Sacramento Valley Inventory Unit. As discussed in more detail under Study Area 14, the Valley aquifers typically allow greater recharge and access to groundwater than the foothill and mountain aquifers, and they provide water for municipal, irrigation and domestic wells.

Study Area 20 is located within the Cherokee Inventory Sub-Unit, the northeast portion of the East Butte Inventory Unit. As discussed in more detail under Study Area 19, the Cherokee Sub-Unit's main water source is groundwater, and agriculture is the primary land use. There are no water service providers operating within or near Study Area 20.

Alternatives 1, 2 and 3 allow minor retail development, and Alternatives 2 and 3 allow approximately 60 and 430 new homes, respectively. Because these alternatives allow minor development and do not have an identified water supply, they receive a C.

## 2. Groundwater Recharge Potential

Study Area 20 is located within the Valley Inventory Unit. It may serve as a moderate or high potential recharge area. Alternatives 1, 2 and 3 allow minor development in this study area, and therefore receive a C.

### *D. Wastewater*

There is currently no publicly managed sewer service in Study Area 20. The current wastewater treatment method is individual septic systems.

#### a. Alternative 1

Alternative 1 calls for limited retail development on about 20 acres. Because this low level of development can effectively be served by septic, this alternative receives a B.

#### b. Alternative 2

Alternative 2 calls for approximately 60 new homes at a very low density, as well as about 30 acres of retail development. This development cannot effectively be served by septic because it would be too dense, nor can it effectively be served by a sewer system because there would be too few homes to support the costs of a new sewer system. Therefore, Alternative 2 receives a D.

#### c. Alternative 3

Alternative 3 calls for approximately 430 new homes at a rural density, as well as about 30 acres of retail development. This development cannot effectively be served by septic because there would be too many new homes, nor can it effectively be served by a sewer system because the density would be too low. Therefore, Alternative 3 receives a D.

### *E. Circulation*

Study Area 20 is served by two major regional roadways, Clark Road (Highway 191) and Durham-Pentz Road.

#### **1. Proximity to Freeways and Major Roadways**

Two major regional roadways, Clark Road and Durham-Pentz Road, run through the study area. Clark Road connects to Highway 70 and Durham-Pentz Road connects with Highway 99. This study area receives an A for access proximity to major roadways.

#### **2. Bicycle Circulation**

Adjacent to the (Clark Road)/Durham-Pentz area, planned bicycle facilities are located along Clark Road and Durham-Pentz Road. Due to the study area's high level of access to planned bicycle facilities and location more than 1 mile from existing urban areas, the study area receives a C.

#### **3. Transit Service**

Transit service is currently provided along Clark Road in the study area. This receives an A.

### *F. Airport Compatibility Zone Conflicts*

Study Area 20 is not located within an Airport Compatibility Zone. Therefore, airport compatibility issues would not limit development under Alternatives 1, 2 or 3.

### *G. Potential Loss of Agricultural Land*

Of the 640 acres in Study Area 20, 625 acres are identified as Grazing Land. This Grazing Land is located throughout the study area, except for a small area along the eastern boundary.

#### a. Alternatives 1 and 2

Under Alternative 1, 20 acres are designated for non-agricultural uses. Assuming the land designated for non-agricultural uses is directed to non-agricultural acres, there would be 5 acres of Grazing Land converted to non-agricultural uses under Alternative 1. Alternative 2 designates 90 acres of land for non-agricultural uses. Assuming the land designated for non-agricultural uses is directed to non-agricultural acres, there would be 75 acres of Grazing Land converted to non-agricultural uses under Alternative 2. Therefore, Alternatives 1 and 2 receive a C.

#### b. Alternative 3

Alternative 3 designates 330 acres of land for non-agricultural uses. Assuming the land designated for non-agricultural uses is directed to non-agricultural acres, there would be 315 acres of Grazing Land converted to non-agricultural uses. Therefore, Alternative 3 receives a D.

### *H. Biological Resources*

This study area consists of a square mile section located in the valley floor at approximately 280 to 520 feet elevation. The study area is within the Butte Regional Conservation Plan (HCP/NCCP) area. The predominant land cover type is grassland, which covers the majority of the study area. Grassland with vernal swale complex occupies approximately one-fourth of the study area and occurs in the western portion. Small areas of ranchettes and irrigated cropland occur in the west. Fallager Creek bisects the study

BUTTE COUNTY GENERAL PLAN 2030  
ALTERNATIVES EVALUATION  
STUDY AREA 20: HIGHWAY 191 (CLARK ROAD)/  
DURHAM PENTZ

area, running from the northeast to southwest corner. Clear Creek runs through the northwest corner and supports valley oak riparian woodland.

One special-status plant, rose mallow, is known to occur in riparian woodland along Clear Creek in the study area.

There are no occurrences of special-status animals known in the study area.

There is Butte Regional Conservation Plan (HCP/NCCP)-modeled habitat in this study area for the following 20 species:

- ◆ Ahart's dwarf rush
- ◆ Bald eagle
- ◆ Butte County checkerbloom
- ◆ Butte County golden clover
- ◆ Butte County meadowfoam
- ◆ Conservancy fairy shrimp
- ◆ Greene's tuctoria
- ◆ Hairy Orcutt grass
- ◆ Hoover's spurge
- ◆ Northwestern pond turtle (perennial Clear Creek and stock ponds)
- ◆ Peregrine falcon
- ◆ Swainson's hawk
- ◆ Tricolored blackbird
- ◆ Valley elderberry longhorn beetle (riparian woodland along Clear Creek)
- ◆ Vernal pool fairy shrimp
- ◆ Vernal pool tadpole shrimp
- ◆ Western burrowing owl
- ◆ Western spadefoot
- ◆ White-tailed kite
- ◆ Yellow-breasted chat (riparian woodland along Clear Creek)

Most of the study area is within Vernal Pool Critical Habitat (Unit 7K) for vernal pool tadpole shrimp.

Grassland with vernal swale complex occupies approximately one fourth of the area, located in the western and central portions. Clear Creek runs through the northwest corner of the study area and supports valley oak riparian woodland.

Most of the study area is outside deer herd habitat; however the northeast corner is on the edge of Intermediate Range habitat.

### **1. Alternative 1**

Under Alternative 1, most of the study area would remain in Agriculture. No new homes would be allowed and the planned Retail development would be located mostly on non-sensitive habitats. Although land use would not change greatly and planned development could be configured to avoid resources, the Agriculture designation could allow grazing range improvements (e.g. fertilizing or disking grasslands) that would damage vernal pool habitat. Therefore, this alternative receives a C for Special-Status Animal and Plant Species, a C for Critical Habitat and other protected lands, a C for Sensitive Habitats, and a C for Deer Herd Habitat.

### **2. Alternative 2**

Alternative 2 would allow only 60 new homes, but locates 300 acres of Retail on sensitive habitats; and some development would occur in the Vernal Pool Critical Habitat Recovery Core Area. Therefore, this alternative receives a C for Special-Status Animal and Plant Species, a D score for Critical Habitat and other protected lands, a D score for Sensitive Habitats, and a C for Deer Herd Habitat.

### **3. Alternative 3**

Under Alternative 3, 30 acres of Retail development would be located partly within sensitive habitats (vernal swale complex) and entirely within the Vernal Pool Critical Habitat Recovery Core Area. A further 150 acres of Rural Residential with 430 new homes would be located in grassland that

provides habitat for special-status wildlife and is within the Vernal Pool Critical Habitat Recovery Core Area, negatively affecting biological resources. Therefore, this alternative receives a C for Special-Status Animal and Plant Species, a D for Critical Habitat and other protected lands, a D for Sensitive Habitats, and a C for Deer Herd Habitat.

### *I. Safety and Hazards*

#### **1. Fire Hazards**

The majority of Study Area 20 is located in a moderate fire severity zone. A small portion of the study area is located in a high fire severity zone in the northwest.

##### **a. Alternative 1**

Under Alternative 1, no land designated for development is included in the high fire severity zone. Therefore, this alternative receives a B.

##### **b. Alternatives 2 and 3**

Since the high fire severity zone covers only a small part of the study area, it is assumed that the 90 acres designated for retail development under Alternative 2 and the 340 acres designated for residential and retail development under Alternative 3 could be located outside of the high fire severity zone. Therefore, these alternatives receive a B.

#### **2. Flood Hazards**

The northwest corner of Study Area 20 is included in the 100-year FEMA flood zone.

##### **a. Alternative 1**

Under Alternative 1, no land designated for development is included in the 100-year FEMA flood zone. Therefore, this alternative receives an A.

b. Alternatives 2 and 3

Since the flood zone covers only a small part of the study area, it is assumed that the 90 acres designated for retail development under Alternative 2 and the 340 acres designated for residential and retail development under Alternative 3 could be located outside of the 100-year FEMA flood zone. Therefore, these alternatives receive a B.

**3. Geologic Hazards**

Study Area 20 has slight and moderate erosion potential, zero to low subsidence potential, low to moderate landslide potential, and low to moderate potential for liquefaction. The majority of the study area, approximately 560 acres, has very high potential for soil expansion. There are no faults located within Study Area 20, or within a 50-foot radius.

a. Alternative 1

Under Alternative 1, approximately 20 acres of land proposed for development has very high potential for soil expansion. Alternative 1 receives a C.

b. Alternatives 2 and 3

Under Alternatives 2 and 3, approximately 560 acres of land proposed or development has very high potential for soil expansion. Alternatives 2 and 3 receive a D.

***J. Cultural Resources***

Study Area 20 lies within the Hamlin Canyon and Cherokee USGS 7.5' quadrangles. Approximately 30 percent of the land in the Hamlin Canyon Quadrangle and 25 percent of the land in the Cherokee quadrangle has been surveyed for cultural resources. To date, no cultural resources sites have been recorded in Study Area 20. This study area lies within a valley region, and has two creeks crossing it. The low number of previously recorded sites

within this small area indicates that this study area is of low sensitivity for cultural resources, though attention should be paid to terrace areas above the creeks.

**1. Alternative 1**

Alternative 1 would result in most of the study area remaining designated as Agriculture and devoted to grazing. Grazing poses a minimal risk of destruction to most types of cultural resources. No designated Resource Conservation land use areas are provided that could be used to protect significant cultural resources. Due to the small area of development and the low sensitivity of the study area, Alternative 1 receives an A.

**2. Alternative 2**

Alternative 2 would result in much of the study area remaining in agriculture, devoted to grazing, with 60 acres designated for very low density residential development and 30 acres designated for retail development. No designated Resource Conservation land use areas are provided. Alternative 2 receives an A.

**3. Alternative 3**

Alternative 3 would result in approximately half of the study area remaining in agriculture, devoted to grazing. Rural residential, mixed residential and retail development would encompass the remainder of the study area. No designated Resource Conservation land use areas are provided. Due to the amount of acreage to be developed and the lack of Resource Conservation that could be used to protect significant historical resources, Alternative 2 receives a C.

***K. Notes***

**BUTTE COUNTY GENERAL PLAN 2030  
ALTERNATIVES EVALUATION**

**STUDY AREA 20: HIGHWAY 191 (CLARK ROAD) /  
DURHAM PENTZ**